



An Introduction to 3T – IBHSC Bioethics Course of The UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Haifa for Medical, Dental and Health Science Teaching Faculty - To Implement the Integrated Bioethics Curriculum in Medical, Dental and Health Science Training

Professor Dr Russell D'Souza Director of Education UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Melbourne Australia Course Director

Preamble

Two land mark studies in 2001 were undertaken by the UNESCO. The studies looked at outcomes from universities teaching Bioethics for over 30 years, where bioethics in the curriculum as a mandatory requirement for accreditation. The results were unsatisfactory, with a lack of translation from the classroom to the doctor / Health care provider patient interface. This teaching was undertaken by trained ethicists and moral philosophers. Following the results of these studies, reforms in the teaching of bioethics was found important. The reform included a change in the methodology of teaching bioethics to medical and health science students and the need for the teaching to be integrated in the training over the entire period of the training including the bed side and clinical arena. Thus, all teaching faculty with additional training and credentialing will be empowered to teach bioethics in their discipline.

The accredited 3T-IBHSc training course has been designed to introduce medical, dental and health science teaching faculty of Universities and Colleges to teaching the modern vertically integrated bioethics curriculum based on the core curriculum, which reflects the 15 principals enshrined in the UNESCO's Universal declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights (2005). The curriculum spans over the entire training of the under graduate and post graduate course and all teaching faculty will teach bioethics with additional training and credentialing. The course and methodology were developed by experts under the Department of education of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Haifa. The 3T-IHSc program is built to Train, Teach and Transfer (Bioethics and Human Rights knowledge) Integrated

Bioethics in the Health Sciences. The Pilot course ran for 5 years and was evaluated with teacher and student satisfaction and outcomes. The results confirmed the translation gap was achieved with high satisfaction from the student and faculty.

The Integrated Bioethics Curriculum and the 3T -IBHSc Course were initially launched by the Honorable Dr Jayshree Mehta President Medical Council of India in March 2015 at the Maharashtra University of Health Sciences Nashik, Maharashtra. The Curriculum has since been approved by the Dental Council of India and the Pharmacy Council of India.

This course has been taken by over 1800 Senior Medical, Dental and Health Science Teaching Faculty of Universities of Health Sciences. The participants have been successfully assessed on completion of this course, that was run for teaching faculties from 10 State Government Universities of Health Sciences, 12 Private Deemed Universities and over 70 Government and private, medical and dental colleges in India. The course evaluation and outcomes have been positive received from systematic, course evaluation and feedback. The successfully trained faculty are expected to return to train their respective departments and introduce the teaching of the Integrated bioethics curriculum at their respective Medical, Dental and Health Science Colleges. The course has also been organized and training of Medical Teaching faculty at Universities at Malaysia Indonesia and Srilanka.

The Course

The Course uses the methodology of a group of 'Co Learners' concept, where training faculty and participant senior teaching faculty are co learners, using the process of 'Learning through osmosis.' Osmosis is the art of unconscious learning. It is where we stop studying materials and start absorbing them. This is an analogy for natural, organic and indirect way of learning. To learn **through osmosis** means a way of **learning seamlessly**. Learning by osmosis is also **about listening**. It is **absorbing the workshopping by role play, debates, cinema street play**. It is **how you apply meaning** to what you see around you. This innate talent **for plucking the meaning out of the presentations**, rather than the facts and figures, is how intuition is developed, which is the pulling force that separates successful knowledge transfer. The 3-4-day course has 3 components

Part A: Bioethics and Human Rights Principals: History, Principles, codes & Guidelines of Ethics, Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights, Autonomy, Privacy

Confidentiality, Informed Consent requirements, Beneficence, Non-Maleficence, Justice Equality and Equity, Human Rights, Human Dignity, Vulnerability, Gender disparity, Non Discrimination and Non Stigmatization and Environmental Ethics and Biosafety.

Part B: Bioethics Knowledge Transfer Technology: Impact of neuro cognition on teaching competencies, Ethical decision making, Case Based Teaching, Communication, Use of emotional Intelligence in Teaching bioethics, Ethical deliberation, innovative teaching methods and assessment technology.

Teaching and assessing of bioethics curriculum integrated in to undergraduate medical, Dental and Health Science subject's. The application of Bioethics in clinical teaching methodology in medical and dental teaching in clinics.

Part C: Integrated Bioethics: The workshopping of break out groups from the various disciplines such as teaching faculties from pre-clinical subjects , para-clinical subjects, clinical subjects, dental, physiotherapy and health sciences. The subject wise curriculum is introduced with ability of faculty to examine and produce an agreed modality and feedback regarding the introducing, teaching and assessing of the bioethics principals as applied with in the respective subjects of the course that they are mandated and accredited teachers. Planning Integration of the bioethics curriculum.

Resultant Outcome

The result is the ability to identify bioethical issues, applying the bioethical principals and the use of bioethical deliberation in decision making and resolving ethical dilemmas. This curriculum is taught and assessed formatively and with summative assessments alongside with every subject of the undergraduate training curriculum in the medical and dental education program.

The Workshop Model

These accredited bioethics course is delivered in a workshop model using a cafeteria setting, using interactive and innovative knowledge transfer methodology. The course will introduce the modern Bioethics knowledge transfer technology which includes the underpinnings of neuro cognition sciences on teaching competencies, emotional intelligence in teaching methodology for medical, dental and health science teaching faculty. The use of innovative

teaching methodology using role play, acting, debates, moral games and cinema, will be demonstrated, with workshopping of the fully evaluated case based teaching methodology, to be used in the teaching and training in undergraduate medical dental and health science education program.

The simulated teaching viva and assessment at the end of the course, will offer dynamic feedback on teaching skills and knowledge transfer technology demonstrated. The successful completion with certification, offers credentials in competencies to teach bioethics in their respective, medical and dental discipline. The added requirements of post graduate qualifications in the discipline and teaching experience are required as a pre-condition to admission for the accredited 3 T-IBHSc bioethics course. The certification offers eligibility for admission and registration with the International Forum of Teachers of Bioethics of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics based at the Medical University of Sophia. Europe

This course is made available to the Health Science Universities hosting nodal centre in the Association of Indian Health Science Universities – UNESCO Chair in Bioethics National Program, Private universities, Government and Private medical and dental colleges that have established bioethics units of the international network of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Haifa.

Model Curriculum Plan of the 3T -IBHSc Bioethics Course

Department of Education UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Haifa

3T - IBHSc International Course in Bioethics for Medical, Dental and Health Science Teaching Faculty of Universities An Initiative of

The Indian Program of the UNESCO Chair in Bioethics Haifa and Association of Indian Health Science Universities (AIHSU) *Train, Teach and Transfer ↔ Empower Impart*

The Vertically & Horizontally Integrated Bioethics Curriculum of the UNESCO Core Curriculum Accredited Training Faculty

Professor Dr Russell D'Souza Course Director Melbourne Australia

Professor Dr Mary Mathew Manipal Head National Training and 3T IBHSc Program

Professor Dr Geethalakshmi Chennai Head National Faculty Training and Development

Professor Dr Princy Palatty Mangalore Head National Integrated Curriculum

Col Professor Dr Derek D'Souza Pune Director National Bioethics Curriculum Implementation Centre

DAY 1 – BASIC CONCEPTS PRINCIPALS – Part I

TIME	TOPIC	FACULTY
9.00AM – 9.30AM	Inauguration & Overview of the 3T IBHSc Bioethics Course	
9.30 AM – 10.15AM q	History, Principles, codes & Guidelines of Ethics Evolution of Codes, Principles & Guidelines, Code of conduct, Codes of medical ethics Nuremberg code, Universal declaration of human rights, MCI Code, Helsinki declaration, Tuskegee syphilis trial, Belmont report, CIOMS, ICMR Guidelines Indian Scenario	
10.15 am to 10.45 am	Universal Declaration on Bioethics & Human Rights On 19 October 2005, the 33rd Session of the General Conference of UNESCO adopted the Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights (hereafter referred to as the	

	<p>Declaration). The Declaration embodies a set of bioethical principles that has been agreed upon by 191 Member States of UNESCO after an intense elaboration and consultation process involving independent and governmental experts from all regions of the world. This set of bioethical principles provides a common global platform by which bioethics can be introduced and strengthened within each Member State, and UNESCO is mandated to promote, disseminate and elaborate these principles for practical purposes</p> <p>UNESCO Bioethics Core Curriculum</p> <p>The UNESCO Bioethics Core Curriculum sets out to introduce the bioethical principles of the Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights to university students. Bioethics teaching has not been introduced in many universities in many countries. This UNESCO Bioethics Core Curriculum can provide an incentive to start introducing such teaching. Its contents are based on the principles adopted in UNESCO. It therefore does not impose a particular model or specific view of bioethics, but articulates ethical principles that are shared by scientific experts, policy-makers and health professionals</p>	
10.45AM – 11.00AM	Tea	
11.00AM – 12.00PM	<p>Autonomy & Consent</p> <p>Respect for personal autonomy; negative liberty, Degrees of self-rule. Respect for Autonomy not absolute – Mill’s harm principal</p> <p>Autonomy Truth, and Difficult choices</p> <p>3 elements of informed consent;</p> <p>Exceptions to the informed consent standard; Proxy decision making; Special status of medical informed consent</p> <p>Case Discussions -Role Play on Autonomy</p>	
12.00PM – 12.30PM	<p>Ethical dimensions of Teaching Bioethics</p> <p>Soft Science in a Hard World. It is a moral enterprise- Trust, Care, Obligation Responsibility.</p> <p>Road blocks in teaching bioethics.</p> <p>The place of Traumatic DE idealization in medical education. Ethical issues in</p>	

	teaching bioethics. Legal and moral responsibility.	
12.30PM – 1.00PM	Lunch	
1.00PM – 2.00PM	<p>Equality, Justice & Equity Types of justice, Concepts of distributive justice, Health care ethics, Munson's principles of distributive justice, Right to health, Role of health professionals in allocating resources</p> <p>Interactive sessions / Moral Games Debates</p>	
2.00PM – 3.00PM	<p>Privacy & Confidentiality Prudery norms is a moral value; the Abject; Biographic privacy Hippocratic Oath- Stigmatization, the Abject; Biographic privacy; IT & Privacy</p> <p>Case Discussions / Role play</p>	
3.00 PM – 4.00PM	<p>Environmental Ethics & Biotechnology Conceptual foundations of environment values as well as issues surrounding societal attitudes, actions and policies to protect and sustain biodiversity and ecological system</p> <p>Interactive sessions & Cinema</p>	
4.00PM – 4.15PM	Tea	
4.15PM – 5. 30 PM	<p>Benefit & Harm "Medical benefit" and "the good; Futility; The common good; The rule of rescue and the defense of necessity- Good Samaritan; Harm; The principle of double effect; The precautionary principle</p> <p>Case Discussion & Debate on Benefit & Harm</p>	

DAY 2 – BASIC CONCEPTS PRINCIPALS – Part II AND KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER TECHNOLOGY

TIME	TOPIC	FACULTY
9.00AM – 10.00AM	Human Dignity & Human Rights - The role of “human dignity” in bioethics; Origins of the ethos of human dignity; the idea of human dignity the normative implications of the value of human dignity; Human Rights; First generation (negative rights) and Second generation (positive rights) – The Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Controversies – ‘Margin of appreciation (principle of subsidiarity)	
	Case Discussions	
10.00AM – 10.45AM	Vulnerable Population, Gender Disparity and Protection Concerns in Bioethics; What makes individuals or countries vulnerable? Exploitation – Clinical research, Health Policy, Research ethics. Inducing vulnerable subjects as exploitation. When can Protection become paternalistic? Context of multinational research and situation of women made vulnerable in cultural / region settings	
	Role Play / Skit Interactive Discussion	
10.45AM – 11.00AM	Tea	
11.00AM – 12. 30PM	Emotional Intelligence in Knowledge Transfer Social Cognition and Mirror neuron system in teaching. Practice self-management, self-awareness, self-regulation, self-motivation, and empathy. Understand, use and manage your emotions. Verbally communicate with others. Successfully communicate with others in a non-verbal manner. The benefits of emotional intelligence Effectively impact others	
	Role play / Acting	
12.30 PM – 1.00PM	Lunch	

1.00PM – 2.00PM	Ethics and Professionalism	
	VIDEO RELATED ACTIVITY	
2.00PM - 3.00PM	Research Ethics	
3.00PM – 4.00PM	Ethical Deliberation The committing from a stance of joint responsibility for patients (Beneficence) and the vales of medical ethics in general. Common theory of deliberation drawing on ‘Reflective equilibrium’3 main modes of reasoning; Specification, Casuistry and balancing of values. Accountability for reasonableness and Moral residue	
	Acting – Modal Hospital Ethics Committee in Deliberation	
4.00PM – 4.15PM	Tea	
4.15PM – 5. 15 pm	Case Based Teaching / Learning Promote discussion of prior knowledge; Encourage cooperation, collaboration, mediation, and negotiation; Promote discussion for understanding; Promote self-direction and interdependence; Promote research and inquiry; Foster discerning judgment of resources. CBL is a thoroughly validated instructional method shown to produce greater learning gains than conventional learning and replicated in several educational research studies. (Lambros 2005)	
	Practice Case 2 Sessions of CBL	
5. PM – 5.30PM	Health Law	

DAY 3 – KNOWLEDGE TRANSFER TECHNOLOGY AND INTEGRATED BIOETHICS

TIME	TOPIC	FACULTY
9.00AM – 9.45AM	Neuro Cognition in Enhancing Teaching Competencies A more scientifically based understanding of the novel brain and how it learns considers the rethinking about teaching. Bioethics. Neurocognitive process includes a number of functions through neuronal networks. Neuro cognition includes perceiving, recognizing, conceiving, judging and reasoning processes. The neurocognitive approach is based upon certain	

	<p>irrefutable facts concerning brain functions, which are applied to the intervention strategies of bioethics teachers. Competencies of content competency, contextual competency, communication competency, classroom management and evaluation competency are vital requirement. In this session, we discuss how the brain and its functions are helpful in teaching and bringing out the dimensions of teaching competency such as induction, content, pedagogy, organization and assessment. We elucidate the Neurocognitive strategies that are helpful to bring out the secrets of amygdala and hippocampus involving in teaching strategies. Introduce the recent development of designing Neurocognitive programme that focus on both cognitive and social development that has theoretical and practical challenges.</p>	
9.45AM – 10.30AM	<p>Teaching Bioethics in a Clinical Setting – Case Assessment and Discussion Model Using a 4 dimensional Model : Medical Factors; Patient Preferences; Quality of Life; Contextual factors, assessment and deliberation for teaching bioethics at the Clinical ward round teaching</p>	
	Demonstration of Ward Round Teaching Discussion	
10.30AM – 10.45 AM	Tea	
10.45AM – 11.30AM	Innovative methods of teaching	
11.30AM – 12.45PM	<p>Assessment Technology: Course, Teacher, Students</p>	
12.45 PM – 1.30PM	LUNCH	
1.30PM – 2.30PM	<p>Integrated bioethics Break Out Rooms Subject Integrated teaching and assessing Medical Pre, Para and Clinical Subject Curriculum Dental Health Sciences Feed Back to be produced</p>	<p>Medical x3 Dental Health Sciences</p>
2.30 PM – 4.15 PM	<p>Simulated Teaching Assessment Participants & Trainer Evaluation x batches & Rooms 10 min Micro Teaching session focussing on delivery methodology Interactive feed Back sessions</p>	<p>SIMULATED TEACHING ASSESSMENT – PANELS OF TRAINERS Group of 8-10</p>

4.15PM – 4.30 PM	Tea	
4.30PM – 5.00PM	Curriculum Integration of Bioethics to Subjects Institutional Road Map for Curriculum Feed Back integration	
5.00 PM – 6.00 PMPM	Valedictory and Certificate Distribution and Closing	

Integrated Bioethics
Subject Integrated Teaching and Assessing
Medical Pre, Para and Clinical
Dental
Health Sciences

DAY 3

PRE-CLINICAL

Day 3 - Anatomy

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30PM	Respect to human body & Respect of dead Privacy & confidentiality, Cultural sensitivities, consent, autonomy Cadaver sources Eugenics Genetic counselling Cadaver Oath

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilit

DAY 3 – Physiology

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM—4.30PM	Animal ethics Privacy & Confidentiality Whistle Blowing Student ethical issues

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Biochemistry

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30PM	Necessity & prudence in the choice of tests Informed consent & refusal of tests Confidentiality Dichotomy

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

PARA-CLINICAL

DAY 3 – Pathology

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30PM	ethics related to use of Biological material Ethical issues in autopsy Ethics in Blood transfusion Ethical pathologists

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Forensic Medicine

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30PM	Laws related to medical practice – Part 1 Laws in related to medical practice – Part 2 Consumer Protection Act MCI Code of Ethics 2002

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Pharmacology

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30PM	Rational drug prescribing Use of expensive drugs Research Ethics – Part 1 Research Ethics – Part 2 Conflict of interest

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Microbiology

TIME	TOPIC
3.45-4.30PM	Lab reports - Confidentiality, privacy, notification & report disclosure Pre & post-test counselling Quarantine & its impact – patient, vector, carrier Specimen transport Bioterrorism

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

CLINICAL

DAY 3 – Medicine

TIME	TOPIC
3.15 PM-4.45PM	Doctor – Patient relationship –Part 1 Doctors' rights & duties Doctor – Patient relationship – Part 2 Patients' rights & duties Risk benefit assessment End of life issues – Medical futility, euthanasia

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Surgery

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30 PM	Benefit vs Harm Consent Emergency case attention Breaking bad news Organ transplantation Vulnerability

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3 – Obstetrics & Gynaecology

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30 PM	Privacy & Confidentiality Beginning of Life issues MEDICAL TERMINATION OF PREGNANCY - CONSENT PNDT Assisted Reproductive Technology

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

DAY 3– Community Medicine

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM-4.30 PM	Public Health Ethics-Part 1 Public Health Ethics-Part 2 Health Education Research Ethics

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitator

Other Clinical Subjects refer to Integrated Bioethics Curriculum

DAY 3 Dental Bioethics

TIME	TOPIC
3.15PM – 4.30 PM	Biomaterials & dental materials Ethical aspects of treatment options in children/ young adults/ geriatric & mentally challenged patients Biotechnology & Dental Research Care & respect for human organs/dental tissue

*Feedback written & verbal from participants & facilitate

Physiotherapy Nursing and Biomedical Science Refer to Curriculum